

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

A peer-reviewed electronic journal



Volume 27, Issue 1
Winter 2017

The Iowa Council for the Social Studies is an affiliate of the National Council for the Social Studies.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Note from the Editor Jason Harshman, University of Iowa	3
<u>Research and Practice</u>	
Trumping Opinions with Facts: Exploring Historical and Contemporary Political Figures' Truth Claims Jeremiah Clabough, University of Alabama—Birmingham	5
<u>Classroom Practice</u>	
Teaching Inquiry through the Music of the Civil Rights Movement Russell Hammack, Jacksonville State University	22
<u>From the Archives</u>	
Reliability and Impact: Student Perceptions of Historical Sources Kerri Potter (originally published in 1997)	33
Music in the American History Course Richard Palmer (originally published in 1953)	41

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

Note from the Editor

Jason Harshman

As social studies educators, researchers, scholars, and advocates know, history has a way of repeating itself. Or, perhaps you prefer how Mark Twain put it: “History doesn’t repeat itself but it often rhymes.” The scholarship included within this issue of the *Iowa Journal for the Social Studies* brings past and present together not only by (re)examining topics and issues at the center of today’s social studies classrooms, but through the physical juxtaposition of current scholarship alongside selections from the newly digitized issues of Iowa’s previous social studies publications: *Iowa Councilor* (1950-1957) and the *Iowa Council for the Social Studies Journal* (1988-2010). In doing so, readers have an opportunity to reflect on patterns and explore important questions around where progress has been made, and further work remains, by and for social studies educators.

Jeremiah Clabough’s “Trumping Opinions with Facts: Exploring Historical and Contemporary Political Figures’ Truth Claims” is a timely look at pressing issues faced by social studies educators, and citizens more broadly, with regard to media literacy and civics. The rapidity with which information is produced and consumed, as well as shared via retweet, post, or “like” across multiple social media platforms, has raised serious concerns about validity, truth, and motive in news. For Clabough, the past year inspired a return to the work done by social studies scholars Engle and Ochoa Becker nearly 30 years ago on “truth claims” and how to pursue validity and accuracy when evaluating statements. This piece couples historical examples with contemporary developments to examine our long history of a free press, the responsibility of the public to be informed, and the role played by social studies educators in preparing students to be civic minded, literate citizens.

Russell Hammack looks at music associated with the civil rights era in U.S. history through the lens of the C3 inquiry arc in his article “Teaching Inquiry through the Music of the Civil Rights Movement.” The author’s close reading of lyrics that served as a commentary and call to action during the 1960s, along with discussion of contemporary songs that offer, unfortunately, similar insights on the denial of equity in the U.S., serve as a springboard for student-centered inquiry in 21st century social studies. The strategies and materials discussed in this article are aligned with the C3 inquiry arc, offering educators a ready-to-use lesson sequence that examines the compelling question “Where is your voice and what is your role in the movement for civil rights?”

During the spring and early summer of 2016, the editor, along with Timothy Patience, a Master’s student in Social Studies and Global Education at the University of Iowa (and now a licensed social studies teacher in Iowa), embarked on digitizing past issues of Iowa Council for the Social Studies journals. With much appreciated support from the Iowa Historical Society in Iowa City and the librarians at the University of Northern Iowa, we were able to produce a public database of all previous publications that is available at: <https://iowajournalforthesocialstudies.weebly.com/>

To highlight some of the work included in this archive, and in the interest of examining patterns within social studies education over the past seventy years, two articles from past incarnations of

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

this journal that align with the issues discussed by Clabough and Hammack have been selected for re-publication. Aligned with Clabough’s examination of sourcing and literacy, Kerri Potter’s article from the 1993 issue of the *Iowa Council for the Social Studies Journal* entitled “Reliability and Impact: Student Perceptions of Historical Sources” is included. Richard Palmer’s article entitled “Music in the American History Course”—published in the April 1953 edition of the *Councilor*—includes suggestions for teaching with music in the social studies. More significantly, Mr. Palmer told readers then, as Dr. Hammack does today, that music is just as important as the dates, names, and places taught about in the social studies. The inclusion of these articles from the archives alongside contemporary commentaries on how this work is done in social studies classrooms serves as an introduction for a special issue of the *Iowa Journal for the Social Studies* that will be published in 2018. The call for proposals can be found at the end of this issue and online at:

Thank you for your readership and support of the *Iowa Journal for the Social Studies*. This publication is not exclusive to Iowa, as demonstrated by the range of authors included in recent issues, so please consider submitting your work for publication, no matter where you research, teach, and advocate for social studies education.

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

Trumping Opinions with Facts:
Exploring Historical and Contemporary Political Figures' Truth Claims

Jeremiah Clabough, University of Alabama—Birmingham

The U.S. political climate has undergone shifts with the 2016 election cycle. American citizens have to be cognizant of alternative facts, fake news, and a President of the United States that perpetuates inaccurate claims when complimentary to him and his administration. Social studies teachers must prepare students to analyze a political figure's claims to determine the authenticity and validity of a person's statements. Shirley Engle and Anna Ochoa-Becker's approaches to examining truth claims are ideal for exploring the validity and accuracy of a statement. In this article, the author discusses Engle and Ochoa-Becker's ideas about teaching truth claims. He provides three activities for examining historical and contemporary political figures' claims. The steps are provided for these activities to where a teacher could replicate each in his or her classroom. These activities build students' analysis skills but more importantly help to prepare them to be democratic citizens.

Keywords: fake news, civic education, students' analysis skills, truth claims

Introduction

The aftermath of the 2016 election and first year of the Trump Presidency created a confusing web of claims, alternative facts, and fake news for American citizens. Mr. Trump regularly makes outlandish claims such as former President Obama wiretapped his New York office (Shear & Schmidt, 2017), inaccurate statements like the U.S. murder rate is at a 47 year high (Diamond, 2017), and refutes any report that he does not agree with and/or portrays him or his administration in a bad light. He has infamously gone so far as to call CNN and *The New York Times* "fake news" (Trump, 2017). In the end, many of Mr. Trump's statements undermine some citizens' faith in the accuracy and credibility of news media. This is an alarming trend considering that the news media serves a vital role in a democracy, as a check on politicians' statements and policy recommendations. News stories also inform the general public about issues and events and through this process help to initiate public discourse about a topic.

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

These current political realities make it difficult for citizens to cut through distortions and inaccurate claims to grasp the truth about an issue or event. In response, social studies teachers are charged with preparing students to deal with this new political norm since, after all, the goal of education is to prepare an informed citizenry (Barr, Barth, & Shermis, 1977). An informed citizen possesses the literacy skills to dissect the claims in sources and apply that knowledge to make informed decisions (Swan & Griffin, 2013). The literacy skills stressed in both Engle and Ochoa's work (1988) and the National Council for the Social Studies' (NCSS) C3 Framework (NCSS, 2013a) are designed to help students critically engage in a dialogue with a person's claims by researching and corroborating an individual's claims. These research skills aid students in making informed decisions about policies and candidates to support, which are vital skills for students to possess as thoughtful and engaged citizens (Grant, 2013). While the pedagogical strategies discussed within this article may be a paradigm shift for many classroom teachers, this shift is a positive and necessary one for the preparation of future generations of democratic citizens.

In this article, the author discusses how Shirley Engle and Anna Ochoa-Becker's approaches to examining truth claims may be utilized to explore historical and contemporary political figures' statements (Engle & Ochoa, 1988). The processes of checking truth claims articulated in Engle and Ochoa's work align with the best intentions of social studies practice articulated in the C3 Framework. The author provides three activities in this article that enable students to scrutinize the accuracy of a political figure's claims through research and analysis of primary sources. These activities build students' analysis skills through corroborating a person's claim, which prepares them to decide for themselves whether a story is accurate or just fake news.

The State of American Political Parties

Both the Republican and Democratic Party have moved farther to the political right and left respectively over the last 40 years (Perlstein, 2008; Carter, 2000; Heilmann & Halperin,

2014). Consequently, politicians have a harder time reaching compromises with the other party out of fear of backlash from their constituents. This type of political climate makes it difficult to accomplish anything and items once as simple as raising the debt ceiling become political struggles designed to create winners and losers. The truth is that these types of political struggles rarely create winners and result in little being accomplished except for a loss of faith in the democratic system by the citizenry (Gallup, 2017).

With this political climate, American citizens are left with the task of cutting through a Gordian knot to make sense of public policies. Once a policy is filtered through conservative and liberal presses and media outlets, it is hard to determine its contents. These media sources are more worried with persuading citizens why a policy is the greatest thing since sliced bread or the worst idea ever conceived, which has helped lead to a large portion of Americans not trusting the reliability and accuracy of information presented in news sources (Mitchell, Gottfried, Barthel, & Shearer, 2016). The political rancor and negative dialogue have reached a point where the majority of supporters of Donald Trump and Hillary Clinton during the 2016 presidential election could not even agree about basic facts (Barthel & Gottfried, 2016). This level of political tribalism results in citizens not objectively evaluating information based on facts. Instead, people view issues through the prism of whether their political party is presented in complimentary or uncomplimentary terms (Foran, 2017). For example, the majority of people that would have been hurt the most by Mr. Trump's failed health care plan, The American Health Care Act, are Americans that voted for Trump. These groups of Trump supporters tend to be older and lower income Americans, especially in rural areas. The cost of these Trump supporters' health care would have increased on average five thousand dollars (Cohn, 2017). The type of dialogue that occurs in American democracy has to be better than this to confront the issues and challenges that we face as a nation (Hess, 2009).

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

The Type of Citizens that American Democracy Needs

The National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) affirms that democratic citizens have an active role to play with political issues (NCSS, 2013b). The active engagement of citizens in a democracy helps to insure that our country does not remain stagnant and addresses important issues. This means that citizens must be able to analyze the merits and weaknesses of a candidate's policies and question contradictions that exist. Staying with an example mentioned previously, candidate Trump promised during an interview on *60 Minutes* that people would be guaranteed the same health care coverage under the Affordable Care Act after he eliminated this law (Roy, 2015). However, Mr. Trump's solution to health care hurts the most disadvantaged and would lead to the top earners in the U.S. saving almost 19 million dollars over the next decade (Luhby, 2017).

Citizens must also deal with the fallout of the Supreme Court ruling of Citizens United that allows for enormous sums of money to be spent on political advertising (Bai, 2012). Additionally, super PACs spend large sums of money on political advertising. As a result, citizens are bombarded by political groups' advertisements through radio, television, and the Internet. This political advertising is designed to play on people's fears and hopes to manipulate them to support a certain position on an issue. To address this reality, social studies teachers can draw upon prompts from the NCSS media literacy position statement to help students analyze the techniques and subtle messages contained within political advertisements (Sperry & Baker, 2016). Some of these prompts look at the techniques used in the advertisement as well as what sources are used to add credibility in the argument. These types of questions help citizens engage with media messaging (Sperry & Baker, 2016).

Examining Truth Claims

Shirley Engle had a different vision for the social studies classroom than one where the teacher lectured for the entire class period. In his seminal article, *Decision Making: The Heart of*

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

the Social Studies, he posits that the social studies classroom should be a place where students analyze the evidence and reach their own conclusions about an issue (Engle, 1960). Engle's ideas with teaching decision making skills along with the work by the Harvard Social Studies Project, spearheaded by Donald Oliver, Fred Newmann, and James Shaver, with inquiry-based teaching to examine public issues led to a new philosophy on how to teach social studies in the 1960s (Engle, 1960; Oliver & Shaver, 1966; Bohan & Feinberg, 2010).

Engle followed up on his work with decision making through the book with Anna Ochoa-Becker: *Education for Democratic Citizenship: Decision Making in the Social Studies* (Engle & Ochoa, 1988). This book provides suggestions on how to design a civic education curriculum. One of the most powerful ideas presented is the concept of analyzing a person's truth claims. Engle and Ochoa stress the importance of analyzing truth claims. "Testing the credibility of claims made by politicians, journalists, government officials, and other citizens is a constant activity of concerned citizenship, since the ability to test truth claims is fundamental to independent and responsible decision making" (Engle & Ochoa, 1988, pp.67-68). To test the credibility of a person's claims, the authors recommend the following steps.

1. The teacher provides a prompt with claims designed to spark students' interest.
2. Students look for evidence from sources to support or refute claims in the teacher's prompt.
3. Once students acquire evidence, they evaluate it by critically analyzing the accuracy and credibility of their sources.
4. Students draw conclusions about the claims in the teacher's prompt.

These four steps change the dynamics of a social studies classroom. Students are actively engaged in inquiry-based activities through completing these four steps to judge the accuracy and credibility of a person's claim. This transforms students from being passive observers in the learning processes to active participants in constructing knowledge for themselves. Ultimately, the

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

goal of engaging students in these four steps is to prepare them for their many roles as future citizens to critically analyze public policies and then make informed decisions based on evidence. As can be seen through these four steps to check the credibility of a claim, Engle and Ochoa advocated for similar goals with social studies instruction that would be later promoted in the inquiry arc of the C3 Framework (NCSS, 2013a).

With the C3 Framework, students explore open-ended questions about a topic by analyzing evidence to reach their own conclusions and then take civic action (NCSS, 2013a). Engle and Ochoa's approach to exploring a truth claim and the inquiry arc of the C3 Framework both advocate for students to analyze the merits of different people's arguments and reach their own conclusions about the validity and credibility of a person's claim. Students determine the accuracy of a statement by corroborating an author's claim with other sources. This allows students to check the accuracy of a person's claims. Through this research, students are equipped to draw conclusions and make decisions based on evidence. These processes help build students' civic identities as they develop their own values and beliefs (Valbuena, 2015). In the next sections, the author provides three activities from different eras in U.S. history that draw on ideas from Engle and Ochoa's truth claims. These activities are intended for use in high school social studies classrooms.

Checking the Authenticity of a Claim

Essential to the inquiry process are the investigation of multiple sources that represent multiple perspectives and the subsequent organization of that information into evidence to support a claim. Such approaches, while not new, can be analyzed for process, rather than content, in order to highlight the steps one can take to foster critical literacy through inquiry. For example, students can examine Chief John Ross' letter (see <http://historymatters.gmu.edu/d/6598/>) discussing how

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

the Cherokee Nation had been treated unfairly with the Treaty of New Echota. This treaty gave land in the Southeastern United States that was owned by the Cherokee Nation to the U.S. government. As part of the scaffolding process, students start by reading the letter in pairs and answering the following questions.

1. How does Chief John Ross feel the Cherokee Nation has been treated through negotiations with the United States? What evidence is presented in his letter to support your argument?
2. Why does Chief Ross question the validity of the Treaty of New Echota? What evidence is presented in his letter to support your argument?

These questions are designed to help students summarize Chief Ross' arguments. By answering the second part of each question, students gain experience using evidence from a primary source to support the reasons that a historical figure gives to support an argument (Wineburg, Martin, & Monte-Sano, 2012).

After students read this letter and answer the questions, there should be a class debriefing. The teacher focuses here on using follow-up questions to get students to support their answers with evidence. Some follow-up questions that may be used include the following:

- 1.) Why do you think that Chief Ross phrased his argument that way?
- 2.) Why would Chief Ross include certain evidence to support his argument?

These questions help students to see the ways that historical figures formulate an argument and can then use this same structure as they reflect on how they construct an argument related to contemporary political and civic developments.

The examination of Chief Ross' letter sets up the next step in the activity. The teacher provides students with texts to explore. One possible text is the Treaty of New Echota, which can result in students exploring the credentials of the people that signed this treaty on behalf of the Cherokee Nation. The U.S. Constitution may also be examined to allow students to explore the

rights of U.S. citizens. As pairs analyze these texts, they complete the graphic organizer in the next section.

Figure 1. Graphic Organizer Validating Chief Ross' Claims

Treaty of New Echota	Signing Representatives for Cherokee Nation with this Treaty	Bill of Rights in U.S. Constitution
1. What are the provisions of the treaty that hurt the Cherokee Nation?	1. What were the credentials of the people that signed the treaty on behalf of the Cherokee Nation?	1. How could the treatment of the Cherokee Nation be a violation of its members' rights as outlined in the Bill of Rights in the U.S. Constitution?
2. Who were the representatives that signed this treaty on behalf of the Cherokee Nation?	2. Why would the credentials of the people that signed this treaty for the Cherokee Nation be controversial?	

With these questions, one leads to the next, which culminates with how this treaty could be interpreted as a violation of the rights of the Cherokee Nation. These questions allow students to weigh evidence from multiple sources to reach their own conclusions (VanSledright, 2002).

After completing the graphic organizer, there is another class debriefing. The pairs share evidence from these primary sources. Students highlight why the representatives' beliefs were not reflective of the majority of the Cherokee Nation. This discussion should also focus on the U.S. government's goal in these negotiations.

All of these steps prepare students for the writing activity. Individually, students use all of the evidence accumulated and write an op-ed piece for a newspaper about whether Chief Ross' claims in his letter are accurate. Students' op-ed piece should be about a page in length. Op-ed pieces are opinion papers about a contemporary issue. This activity helps students articulate their findings about a historical figure's claims (Carano & Clabough, 2016).

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

In this case, Chief Ross was accurate that representatives from a minority of the Cherokee Nation entered into a treaty with the U.S. government on behalf of the entire tribe. The exploration of issues like the Treaty of New Echota help students analyze how some people's statements are made to point out social injustices. It is important to remember that the Treaty of New Echota played a major part in leading to the Trail of Tears, which resulted in the estimated deaths of over 4,000 members of the Cherokee Nation. Students can see how certain claims when ignored may have ripple effects that can have negative repercussions (Westheimer, 2011).

Dispelling Historical Figures' Alternative Realities

Some people cannot or will not see the truth about issues or events. Their biases, values, and beliefs prevent them from doing so. They weave narratives that suit the truth that they want to believe and have convinced themselves to believe. Social studies teachers need to set up opportunities for students to dispel some people's alternative realities. One notorious example is that of segregationists opposed to the Civil Rights Movement.

The teacher may start by having students examine the speech George Wallace delivered at his 1963 inauguration as Governor of Alabama (see <http://digital.archives.alabama.gov/cdm/ref/collection/voices/id/2952>). Students read this text in groups and complete a word web centered around the following compelling question: Why did segregationists feel justified for supporting segregation, and according to them, what were the consequences of integration? The teacher guides a class debriefing after the students complete their graphic organizers.

The teacher replicates the same analysis processes with Dr. Martin Luther King Jr.'s *I Have a Dream Speech* (see <http://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/mlkihaveadream.htm>). While Governor Wallace articulated segregationists' beliefs about the Civil Rights Movement, Dr. King conveyed a different vision for the United States. In the same groups of three, students

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

answer the following question with a word web. According to Dr. King, why did civil rights activists feel segregation had to be opposed, and what were the outcomes of integration? This activity helps students grasp Dr. King's views about segregation.

Students share their findings from analyzing Dr. King's speech. The key to this class discussion is to help students capture Dr. King's perspective and compare and contrast it to George Wallace's perspective. One obvious question that needs to be addressed is the violence and lawlessness that Governor Wallace speaks of in his address. From examining the method of non-violent civic disobedience employed by civil rights activists like Dr. King and studying historical records, it is clear that segregationists are mainly causing the violence and lawlessness that Governor Wallace is speaking about (as evidenced by the Freedom Riders and Birmingham Children's March). Therefore, the credibility of this part of Governor Wallace's argument is undermined. This sets up another question: Why would Governor Wallace blame civil rights activist for the violence? Discussion of this and other related question prepares students for a perspective-writing activity that requires use of evidence drawn from the primary sources.

Perspective-writing activities allow students to capture and articulate the thoughts, feelings, and biases of a historical figure (Shaftel & Shaftel, 1967). As part of this perspective-writing activity, students assume the role of a civil rights activist and respond to Governor Wallace's arguments around violence and lawlessness. Through this activity, students gain experience examining how political figures often make statements to justify their opinions, even when the evidence does not support their claims. The idea can be clearly seen when segregationists are complaining about the violence and mayhem they created.

The ability to detect false statements is a critical skill for students to possess when assessing the merits of a political figure's statements, claims, and policy recommendations (Ochoa-Becker, 2007). Through possessing these analysis skills, students can make informed

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

decisions on whether to support or refute a political figure's claims. They need to remember that many political figures make statements to help further their own political ends. The ability to detect misleading statements enables our students, as future citizens, to hold their leaders accountable for inaccurate claims and policy recommendations (Levine, 2007).

Checking and Responding to the Inaccurate Claims of the "Ernest Hemingway of 140 Characters"

Donald Trump likes to think of himself as the "Ernest Hemingway of 140 characters" (Collins, 2015). He uses Twitter to reach his supporters without the filter of traditional media outlets. A story ran in a traditional news outlet goes through the filters of having sources checked and facts verified. Donald Trump does not want these filters.

The problem is that Donald Trump does not always make truthful claims. This is not a new phenomenon with American presidents. What is striking about Donald Trump's inaccurate claims is the ease in which his statements can be disproven. For example, Trump claimed on February 7, 2017 through Twitter that his Cabinet not being assembled was the longest stretch of this happening in U.S. history. A person can do a simple Google search to find that it took Bill Clinton longer to get his entire Cabinet approved. Trump's inaccurate statements and claims through Twitter often derive from a combination of his personal feelings about a matter and stories from right wing news outlets.

The teacher needs to set up opportunities for students to explore Trump's claims through Twitter. All of Trump's tweets can be accessed from CNN Politics (<http://www.cnn.com/interactive/2017/politics/trump-tweets/>). One ideal topic to explore is Trump's insistence on banning immigrants from certain Middle Eastern countries. Students can explore one of his tweets about banning immigrants from February 4th, which is provided below.

Figure 2. Donald Trump Tweet from February 4, 2017



Students can research the claims in this tweet about whether Middle Eastern countries support this immigration ban. In doing so, they will likely find evidence from the foreign minister of Kuwait that disproves this statement. The teacher may provide students with fact checking of Trump's claims by *The New York Times* (https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2016/us/elections/fact-check.html?_r=2), *The Washington Post* (https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/fact-checker/wp/2017/02/10/heres-what-trump-got-wrong-on-twitter-this-week-5/?utm_term=.d53fe583907), or Politifact (<http://www.politifact.com/personalities/donald-trump/>). Students write down evidence that disproves Trump's tweet. There should be a class debriefing where students share their findings. Follow-up questions need to focus on how we can establish the credibility of a source. Another follow-up question to be explored is why Trump would blatantly make this inaccurate statement. In the interest of working with current media forms, students can compose two response tweets to Donald Trump's tweet about the immigration ban.

Student-Response Tweet Examples

@realDonaldTrump needs to do his homework before making inaccurate claims about travel ban. Minister from Kuwait says Mr. Trump is wrong!

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

@realDonaldTrump stirring fear that people from Middle Eastern countries are dangerous and not welcome in U.S. However, America is a land of immigrants.

Though it may appear unconventional to some, Mr. Trump's use of Twitter to convey his policies and vision for the country is a reality that requires discussion in classrooms. Therefore, the examination of Mr. Trump's tweets becomes key insight into his values, biases, and beliefs with issues and this activity helps students take civic action against discriminatory immigration policies that are not rooted in facts but instead in Mr. Trump's personal opinions (Skoll & Kirstange, 2013; Justice & Stanley, 2016).

It is important for students to realize that they have an active role to play in a democracy. Citizens must hold elected officials accountable for their statements and policies. To do so, they must be actively involved in the national dialogues about issues. This can take the form of writing about an issue for a local paper or creating social media posts about a topic. Regardless of the way students take civic action, they come to realize the power that their voice can have as part of a national dialogue about an issue (Levstik & Barton, 2015).

Conclusion

In this article, I have provided three activities to explore historical and contemporary political figures' truth claims. With some claims, they are not unlike a Rorschach test where you can see what you want to see. A political figure's claims that cannot be supported with evidence are simply his or her opinions. Social studies teachers need to set up opportunities for students to explore politicians' truth claims. The processes of exploring truth claims build students' analysis skills as outlined in the C3 Framework while also preparing them for their future responsibilities as democratic citizens. The vitality of our democracy rest in the will of citizens being actively involved to call out politicians that make self-serving claims and prevent social injustices (Parker, 2015).

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

Some teachers may be reticent to discuss issues connected to the Trump administration, which could be deemed too controversial. However, checking the truth claims of a politician is an item that transcends political affiliation and gets at the heart of social studies teaching advocated for in the C3 Framework. It is recommended that the social studies teacher use claims from U.S. politicians from both sides of the aisle with the three activities discussed in this article. Students need to be able to research claims and analyze sources to reach conclusions based on facts.

Social studies teachers must equip students with the necessary pre-requisite skills to function as democratic citizens. One of those skills is using evidence to check the reliability of a person's statement. The ability to successfully analyze a politician's truth claims is critical to undo our current political norm where arguments grounded in opinion are weighed by some with the same merit as those steeped in evidence.

Author Bio:

Jeremiah Clabough is an Assistant Professor in Social Science Education at the University of Alabama at Birmingham. He is the lead author of *When the Lion Roars Everyone Listens: Scary Good Middle School Social Studies* (Clabough, Turner, & Carano, 2017). His area of research is teaching topics in civic education. **Email:** jclabou2@uab.edu

References

- Bai, M. (2012, July 17). How much has Citizens United changed the political game? *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/07/22/magazine/how-much-has-citizens-united-changed-the-political-game.html>
- Barr, R., Barth, J., & Shermis, S. (1977). *Defining the social studies*. The National Council for the Social Studies. Bulletin 51. Arlington, VA: NCSS.
- Barthel, M. & Gottfried, J. (2016). Majority of U.S. adults think news media should not add interpretation to the facts. *Pew Research Center*. Retrieved from <http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2016/11/18/news-media-interpretation-vs-facts>
- Bohan, C.H. & Feinberg, J. (2010). Leader-writers: The contributions of Donald Oliver, Fred Newmann, and James Shaver to the Harvard Social Studies Project. In B. Stern (Ed.), *The new social studies: People, projects, and perspectives* (111-132). Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Carter, D. (2000). *The politics of rage: George Wallace, the origins of the new conservatism, and the transformation of American politics*. Baton Rouge, LA: Louisiana State University Press.
- Carano, K. & Clabough, J. (2016). Images of struggle: Teaching human rights with graphic novels. *The Social Studies*. 107, 14-18.
- Cohn, N. (2017, March 10). Trump supporters have the most to lose in the G.O.P. repeal bill. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/10/upshot/why-trump-supporters-have-the-most-to-lose-with-the-gop-repeal-bill.html?_r=0
- Collins, E. (2015). Trump: 'I'm the Ernest Hemingway of 140 characters.' *Politico*. Retrieved from <http://www.politico.com/story/2015/11/trump-ernest-hemingway-216109>
- Diamond, J. (2017, February 7). Trump falsely claims U.S. murder rate is "highest" in 47 years. *CNN News*. Retrieved from <http://www.cnn.com/2017/02/07/politics/donald-trump-murder-rate-fact-check/>
- Engle, S. (1960). Decision making: The heart of the social studies. *Social Education*, 24(7), 301–306.
- Engle, S. & Ochoa, A. (1988). *Education for democratic citizenship: Decision making in the social studies*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Foran, C. (2017, March 29). Why do so many Republicans believe Trump's wiretap claims? *The Atlantic Monthly*. Retrieved from <https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2017/03/trump-wiretap-claim-obama-republicans/521244/>

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

- Gallup. (2017, July 12). *Americans' approval of Congress remains low, steady*. Retrieved from http://www.gallup.com/poll/213944/americans-approval-congress-remains-low-steady.aspx?g_source=GOVERNMENT&g_medium=topic&g_campaign=titles
- Grant, S.G. (2013). From inquiry arc to instructional practice: The potential of the C3 framework. *Social Education*, 77(6), 322-326, 351.
- Heilemann, J. & Halperin, M. (2014). *Double down: Game change 2012*. New York, NY: Penguin Books.
- Hess, D. (2009). *Controversy in the classroom: The democratic power of discussion*. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Justice, B., & Stanley, J. (2016). Teaching in the time of Trump. *Social Education*, 80(1), 36-41.
- Levine, P. (2007). *The future of democracy: Developing the next generation of American citizens*. Medford, MA: Tufts University Press.
- Levstik, L. & Barton, K. (2015). *Doing history: Investigating with elementary and middle schools* (5th ed.), New York, NY: Routledge.
- Luhby, T. (2017, March 12). Here's how much millionaires would save under GOP Obamacare repeal bill. *CNN Money*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/10/upshot/why-trump-supporters-have-the-most-to-lose-with-the-gop-repeal-bill.html?_r=0
- Mitchell, A., Gottfried, J., Barthel, M., & Shearer, E. (2016, July 7). Trust and accuracy. *Pew Research Center: Journalism & Media*. Retrieved from <http://www.journalism.org/2016/07/07/trust-and-accuracy/>
- NCSS. (2013a). *The college, career, and civic life framework for social studies state standards: Guidance for enhancing the rigor of K-12 civics, economics, geography, and history*. Silver Spring, MD: Author.
- NCSS. (2013b). *Revitalizing civic learning in our schools*. Retrieved from http://www.socialstudies.org/positions/revitalizing_civic_learning
- Ochoa-Becker, A. (2007). *Democratic education for social studies: An issues-centered decision making curriculum*. Charlotte, NC: Information Age Publishing.
- Oliver, D. & Shaver, J. (1966). *Teaching public issues in the high school*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin.
- Parker, W. (2015). Social studies education ec21. In W. Parker (Ed.), *Social studies today: Research and practice* (3-13). New York, NY: Routledge.

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

- Perlstein, R. (2008). *Nixonland: The rise of a president and the fracturing of America*. New York, NY: Simon and Schuster.
- Roy, A. (2015, September 28). Donald Trump on Obamacare on *60 Minutes*: 'Everybody's got to be covered' and 'the government's gonna pay for it.' *Forbes*. Retrieved from <https://www.forbes.com/sites/theapothecary/2015/09/28/donald-trump-on-obamacare-on-60-minutes-everybodys-got-to-be-covered-and-the-governments-gonna-pay-for-it/#30dd3f5c540e>
- Shaftel, F. & Shaftel, G. (1967). *Role-playing for social values: Decision making in the social studies*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall Inc.
- Shear, M. & Schmidt, M. (2017, March 4). Trump, offering no evidence, says Obama tapped his phones. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/04/us/politics/trump-obama-tap-phones.html?mcubz=3>
- Skoll, G. R., & Korstanje, M. E. (2013). Constructing an American fear culture from red scares to terrorism. *International Journal Human Rights and Constitutional Studies*, 1(4), 341-364.
- Sperry, C. & Baker, F.W. (2016). Media literacy: A position statement of National Council for the Social Studies. *Social Education*, 80(3), 183-185.
- Swan, K. & Griffin, S. (2013). Beating the odds: The college, career, and civic life (C3) framework for social studies state standards. *Social Education*, 77(6), 317-321.
- Trump, D.J. [realDonaldTrump]. (2017, April 1). It is the same Fake News Media that said there is "no path to victory for Trump" that is now pushing the phony Russia story. A total scam! [Tweet]. Retrieved from <https://twitter.com/realDonaldTrump/status/848158641056362496.10>
- Valbueana, R. (2015). Cultivating curiosity and active citizenship: Teaching voting and the history of voting rights. *Social Studies and Young Learner*, 28(2), 5-8.
- VanSledright, B. (2002). *In search of America's past: Learning to read history in elementary school*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.
- Westheimer, J. (2011). Politics and patriotism in education. In J. DeVitis (Ed.), *Critical civic literacy: A reader* (81-92). New York, NY: Peter Lang.
- Wineburg, S., Martin, D., & Monte-Sano, C. (2012). *Reading like a historian: Teaching literacy in middle and high school history classrooms*. New York, NY: Teachers College Press.

Teaching Inquiry through the Music of the Civil Rights Movement

Russell Hammack, Jacksonville State University

This article exemplifies the possibilities of teaching the Civil Rights Movement (1954-1965) through the use of music and using inquiry-based instruction. Ten Civil Rights songs, extended from popular and folk music, are provided along with the Inquiry Design Model (IDM) from C3 Teachers. This constructivist approach to building historical knowledge allows students to engage, feel, and empathize with the musical artist as vivid accounts of trial, struggle, and triumph are detailed explaining specific events and overarching concepts of the Civil Rights Movement (1954-1965). In preparing this concept for the classroom, the IDM Model is explained in linear steps to provide a framework for a lesson or learning segment. References to contemporary developments around civil rights, and the way in which music has documented and responded to these developments, are also included.

Keywords: Civil Rights Movement, music, inquiry-based instruction, primary sources

Introduction

Commonly referred to as the Civil Rights Movement, the events and developments that occurred between 1954-1965 transcended the era during which African Americans demanded social equality and freedom for everyone. This tumultuous period gave us the bravery of Rosa Parks and Ruby Bridges, the eloquence of Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr., the tragedy of Emmett Till, the empowerment of the Southern Christian Leadership Conference, and the climactic achievement of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and the Voting Rights Act of 1965. It is unfortunate that in many social studies classrooms, however, that the music of the civil rights movement, an arguably imperative component of the era, has been underutilized. As social studies teachers, it is essential for us to incorporate all of the possible instructional resources to make meaningful and relevant connections for our students through the use of primary sources, including music.

Primary Sources as an Instructional Tool

Primary sources can offer an uninterrupted look through the eyes of people describing their personal and unique experiences at a moment and place (Mintz, 2003). According to Costa and Doyle (2004), primary sources offer a rich complexity for students to understand and construct

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

history by allowing them to take on the roles of archivists and researchers by collecting and analyzing primary sources. Therefore, primary source evaluation and inquiry allows students to become the historians themselves, thus, constructing their own historical narratives. “Student historians” examine primary sources, consider multiple perspectives, conduct analysis, and develop historical interpretations (Bass & Rosenzweig, 1999). This type of analysis allows for students to deepen their understanding of the historical content through investigation and inquiry. Levitsky (2016) contends that “students who are asked, not to memorize, but to grapple with, analyze, and evaluate problems in history are far more likely, not only to remember information but understand why they are remembering it” (p. 405). Primary sources, including music, offer a personal account of historical knowledge, which can be used to construct historical truth by analyzing the perspectives of the source. The incorporation of primary source materials grants students the opportunity to critically evaluate the inflamed social practices of discrimination from their own personal historical perspective; thus, deepening their content knowledge through the music of the historical era.

An appealing aspect of analyzing music is the expression of emotion and humanity through song (Moore, 2007). Music provides the rhythmic medium to ponder the cultural struggles that empower our society on a variety of different, but interrelated, social issues (Szatmary, 2000). Song lyrics provide an avenue of inquiry-based research within the movements of social justice, such as the Civil Rights Movement, to offer a societal reflection of protest, reform, and jubilation. From the insightful lyrical ballads, students can empathize with the participants of the movement, the reasons for protest, and the tragedies and struggles that were endured. This empathetic evaluation of primary resources brings insight and awareness of the content related events and situations of the Civil Rights Movement (1954-1965). This development allows students to

conceptualize the history they hear through music, and examine the social dialogue that music attempts to reflect in culture and society.

Music in Civil Rights Movement

Folk and popular music from the Civil Rights Movement, considered for the sake of this article to be from 1954 to 1965, directly reflected and mirrored the feelings and the tragedies of the era. Song artists were able to portray their ideas, stories, beliefs, and personal connections through their lyrics and songs. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. (1964) stated,

In a sense the freedom songs are the soul of the movement. They are more than just incarnations of clever phrases designed to invigorate a campaign; they are as old as the history of the Negro in America. They are adaptations of the songs the slaves sang- the sorrow songs, the shouts of joy, the battle hymns and the anthems of our movement (p. 61).

Although there are many remarkable and relevant songs that emerged during this era, a carefully selected series of songs that could be immediately implemented for a social studies classroom were chosen for this unit. These songs were selected based on the overarching theme of freedom during the Civil Rights Movement (1954-1965), detailing the tragedy of Emmett Till and Medgar Evers, sorrowfully describing the bombing of the 16th Street Baptist Church that killed four young Black girls, protests and marches in Birmingham, songs performed during the Selma to Montgomery March, and the March on Washington in 1963. These songs were not only performed during the Civil Rights Movement (1954-1965), but also extended from folk and popular music. They are as follows:

1. *The Death of Emmett Till* by Bob Dylan
2. *We Shall Overcome* by Mahalia Jackson
3. *Birmingham Sunday* by Richard Farina, performed by Joan Baez
4. *A Change is Gonna Come* by Sam Cooke

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

5. *Eyes on the Prize* by Sweet Honey in the Rock
6. *We Shall Not Be Moved* by Mavis Staple
7. *Only A Pawn In Their Game* by Bob Dylan
8. *I'm On My Way* by Odetta
9. *Aint No Body Gonna Turn Me Round* by Joan Baez
10. *Black and White* by David Arkin and Earl Robinson, performed by Pete Seeger

Bob Dylan's 1962 lyrical recounting of the kidnapping and brutal racism that ultimately killed fourteen year-old Emmett Till in 1955 reads:

T'was down in Mississippi no so long ago,
when a young boy from Chicago town stepped through a Southern door.
This boy's dreadful tragedy I can still remember well,
the color of his skin was black and his name was Emmett Till.
Some men they dragged him to a barn and there they beat him up.
They said they had a reason, but I can't remember what.
They tortured him and did some evil things too evil to repeat.
There was screaming sounds inside the barn,
there was laughing sounds out on the street (p.1).

In "Birmingham Sunday," Richard Farina recounts the tragic death of four little girls on a Sunday morning at the 16th Street Baptist Church in Birmingham, Alabama. Although unaware of the bomb that would take their lives, their sacrifice signified two driving forces within the Civil Rights Movement: the city of Birmingham as the epicenter for resistance to integration and also the importance of young people in helping participate in the movement for desegregation, respect, and equality. As Farina (1964) composes:

Come round by my side and I'll sing you a song.
I'll sing it so softly, it'll do no one wrong.
On Birmingham Sunday the blood ran like wine,
and the choirs kept singing of Freedom.
That cold autumn morning no eyes saw the sun, and Addie Mae Collins,
her number was one.
At an old Baptist church there was no need to run,
and the choirs kept singing of Freedom (p.1).

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

In one of the most enduring songs of the movement, Mavis Staples sings about the perseverance and determination of the Civil Rights Movement in “We Shall Overcome”

We shall not, we shall not be moved.
We shall not, we shall not be moved.
We're fighting for our freedom, we shall not be moved.
We shall not, we shall not be moved.
We shall not, we shall not be moved.
We're fighting for our children, we shall not be moved (p.1).

Today, inspirational music depicting scenes of the civil rights era continues with films like *Selma*. The Academy Award winning song, *Glory* by John Legend and Common (2014), bridges the past with the present with lyrics like:

The movement is a rhythm to us.
Freedom is like religion to us.
Justice is juxtapositionin' us.
Justice for all just ain't specific enough.
One son died, his spirit is revisitin' us.
Truant livin' livin' in us, resistance is us.
That's why Rosa sat on the bus.
That's why we walk through Ferguson with our hands up.
When it go down we woman and man up.
They say, "Stay down", and we stand up.
Shots, we on the ground, the camera panned up.
King pointed to the mountaintop and we ran up (p. 1).

Along with community and national civil rights issues today, students can use modern forms of lyrical expression to detail their experience and feelings of personal historical accounts. According to Ladson-Billings (2014), this type of culturally relevant pedagogy promotes a sociopolitical consciousness where students use skills to reflect upon and work to solve real world problems.

Inquiry in the Social Studies Classroom

One instructional practice that develops investigation through experiential learning is inquiry-based instruction. Inquiry based instruction allows for disciplinary questioning, academic exploration, performance task understanding, and developing skills need to defend ideas (NCSS,

2013). This type of instruction offers students the opportunity to construct their own knowledge from the school curriculum into their lives through investigation, analysis, and experiential connections (Spronken-Smith, Walker, Batchelor, O'Steen, & Angelo, 2011). Carin, Bass, and Contant (2005) claim that inquiry based learning includes portions of engagement, exploration, explanation, elaboration, and evaluation. Specifically, the NCSS C3 Framework Dimension three encourages the evaluation of sources and to develop claims with supporting evidence (NCSS, 2013). This type of inquiry based instruction support a constructivist view of building knowledge through creating arguments supported by primary sources; including music. Due to the inquisitive nature of inquiry based learning, along with the evaluation and analysis needed to construct history through primary sources, one model of inquiry for Social Studies classrooms is the Inquiry Design Model (IDM) from C3 Teachers (C3Teachers, 2016).

Classroom Use

The IDM provides a framework of questions, tasks, and performance based assignments leading to outline historical inquiry (C3 Teachers, 2016). It takes shape from the C3 Inquiry Arc by developing compelling and supporting questions, having performance based assessments, and cultivating both expertise and disciplinary skills in students (C3 Teachers, 2016). The IDM blueprint model by Swan, Lee, and Grant, provides an excellent framework to investigate the Civil Rights Movement (1954-1965) through the primary sources of folk and popular music (Swan, Lee, & Grant, 2016). In using the IDM blueprint (see Appendix One), here are some suggestive steps:

Step One- Inquiry begins with and is driven by the design and investigation of compelling, provocative, perhaps even controversial, questions. Compelling and supporting questions function as the framework for the inquiry, thus, supplying a conceptual configuration as students develop a rich understanding. For this lesson, the compelling question “Where is your voice and what is your role in the movement for civil rights?” is designed to have students examine how singers

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

contributed to the civil rights movement and how students, as part of an ongoing struggle for equality, can play a role in the current incarnation of the movement for civil rights.

Step Two- Inspired by the compelling question, and through the design of scaffolding or supporting questions by teachers and students, the formative performance task of examining the music from the Civil Rights Movement and evaluating what the authors or artists conveyed about a particular historical event or situation is engaged. This type of inquiry model can help to produce a rich understanding and point of view analysis of the civil rights movement and include a detailed orientation concerning the assessment of primary sources through song. The extent to which the issues of that era are reflected in today's music, and the degree to which the civil rights movement was successful and continues, can be explored.

Step Three- As the lesson or segment moves to the end, students began the summative performance task portion. In this part of the IDM, students construct an argument using specific claims and evidence from the sources provided. For this inquiry, the songs from the civil rights movement and today will be the featured primary sources, and can support student inquiry around many civil rights related issues such as race, poverty, jobs, the environment, and more.

Step Four- Referred to as informed action, students are able to use their knowledge and experience from the inquiry and proceed with relevant issues and activities of today that allow them to demonstrate their expertise in a real world context. Teachers might consider allowing students to focus on a local or national issue concerning social justice, and construct their own song or other form of digital media.

Conclusion

For social studies teachers, music of the civil rights movement adds to the content related primary sources that detail the experiences of this era. Through inquiry based instruction, students have the opportunity to evaluate the civil rights movement from a constructivist nature that

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

permits not only evaluation, but grants students the purpose to develop a rich viewpoint from the lyrical artists that sang freedom songs, and inspired popular music. This type of inquiry based instruction complements the NCSS C3 Framework, specifically dimension three, which promotes that students conduct a critical analysis of primary sources, including the development their own evidence based arguments (NCSS, 2013).

When infused into a social studies class, music can provide the emotional spark of compassion and tolerance, along with reflection, that will deepen understanding around a specific time or event. Through inquiry and historical investigation, each song becomes a story that mirrors a broader narrative of the civil rights movement that illustrates how and why the fight for freedom, equality, and social justice continues today.

Author Bio:

Russell Hammack is currently an Assistant Professor of Secondary Education at Jacksonville State University. He was nominated twice for Alabama Teacher of the Year and twice for the Jacksonville State Teacher Hall of Fame. **Email:** rhammack@jsu.edu

References

- Bass, R., & Rosenzweig, R. (1999). Rewiring the history and social studies classroom: Needs, frameworks, dangers, and proposals. *Social Education, 181*(3), 25-42.
- C3 Teachers. (2016). Inquiry Design Model. Retrieved September 8, 2016, from <http://www.c3teachers.org/inquiry-design-model/>
- Carin, A. A., Bass, J. E., & Contant, T. L. (2005). *Teaching science as inquiry*. New Jersey: Pearson-Prentice Hall.
- Coasta, T., & Doyle, B. (2004). Runaway slave advertisements: Teaching from primary documents. *Social Education, 58*(4), 4-10.
- Dylan, B. (1962). *The Death of Emmett Till* [Record]. Warner Brother, Inc.
- Farina, R. (1964) *Birmingham Sunday* [Record]. Performed by Joan Baez. Vanguard.
- King, M. L. (1964). *Why We Can't Wait*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2014). Culturally relevant pedagogy 2.0: a.k.a. the Remix. *Harvard Educational Review, 84*(1), 74-84.
- Legend, J. & Common. (2014). *Glory* [CD]. Columbia Records.
- Levitsky, R. (2006). Musings on meaning, Meatloaf, and Moe: Reflections on The State of Social Studies. *Social Education, 7*(7), 405-408.
- Mintz, S. (2003). Using primary source documents. *OAH Magazine of History, 17*(3), 41-43. doi:10.1093/maghis/17.3.41
- Moore, J. R. (2007). Popular music helps students focus on important social issues. *Middle School Journal, 38*(4), 21-29. doi:10.1080/00940771.2007.11461589
- National Council for the Social Studies. (2013). *College, career, and civic life (C3) framework for state social studies standards*. Washington D.C.: NCSS.
- Spronken-Smith, R., Walker, R., Batchelor, J., O'steen, B., & Angelo, T. (2011). Enablers and constraints to the use of inquiry-based learning in undergraduate education. *Teaching in Higher Education, 16*(1), 15-28. doi:10.1080/13562517.2010.507300
- Staples, M. (2007). *We Shall Not Be Moved* [Record]. ANTI.
- Swan, K., Lee, J., & Grant, S. G. (2014). Inquiry Design Model. Retrieved September 8, 2016, from <http://www.c3teachers.org/inquiry-design-model/>

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

Szatmary, D. P. (2000). *Rockin' in Time: A Social History of Rock and Roll*. Toronto: Prentice Hall.

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies

Appendix A: Inquiry Design Model Blueprint (IDM) for C3 Inquiry Arc

Inquiry Design Model (IDM) Blueprint™		
Compelling Question		
Standards and Practices		
Staging the Question		
Supporting Question 1	Supporting Question 2	Supporting Question 3
Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task	Formative Performance Task
Featured Sources	Featured Sources	Featured Sources
Summative Performance Task	Argument	
	Extension	
Taking Informed Action		

Reliability and Impact: Student Perceptions of Historical Sources



by

Kerri A. Potter
Instructor
West High School
Iowa City, Iowa

*I*n this study I examined how high school history students view historical sources such as textbooks, photographs, drawings, film, and poetry. Which of these sources do students consider reliable and why? Which forms do they feel have the biggest impact on them and why?

Subjects and Methodology

The sophomores enrolled in my History of Europe III classes at West High School were the participants in my study. History of Europe III is a class for students of varying abilities, and this research took place during our study of World War I. During this unit, as in previous units, I offered students a variety of primary sources to interpret and evaluate. On the last day of the unit, I distributed a survey in which students were asked to rate the reliability or accuracy of a number of sources used during the unit, with one meaning "not reliable" and five meaning "very reliable." They were also asked to write comments explaining why they considered a particular source to be reliable or unreliable. Next students were

asked to rate the impact each source made on them or how long they thought they would remember it. Space was provided for comments regarding their rating of sources. I asked students to be as thorough and honest as possible, and reassured them that there were no “right answers.”

Results and Analysis

Articles and photographs are real. Historians have gathered the facts and photographers were at the scene. Filmmakers, artists, and songwriters use their own interpretations.

This quote exemplifies many students' faith in the truth of photography and historians' accounts of history. Illustrating the impact of forms other than the text.

The photos and films contained such amazing pictures that I'll remember them a lot longer than the dry readings. The poems were really descriptive and made me think about what went on more than the readings that were just the facts and dates.

The students in my study found photography and film to be the most reliable sources of historical information; however, they judged historians' articles and the textbook to be more reliable than other art forms such as drawing or poems. In terms of impact, students overwhelmingly rated photographs and film first and second, and for the most part did not feel the textbook had a big impact on them.

This research is significant because it shows how critical are the sources a history teacher chooses. If students overwhelmingly find photographs to be reliable and memorable, should not history teachers employ photographs more often in their classrooms? Because film has such a large impact on students, teachers may need to be extra careful about what films they show and how they are debriefed. The fact that many students do not find textbooks to be memorable may mean we need to make them one of many sources of historical information, instead of the driving force in a curriculum.

**AVERAGE RATING AND RANKING
OF EACH SOURCE ON SURVEY.**

5 = "VERY RELIABLE" / "BIG IMPACT"

1 = "NOT RELIABLE" / "NO IMPACT"

<u>RELIABILITY</u>		<u>IMPACT</u>	
1. Photos	4.60	1. Photos	4.56
2. Film	3.92	2. Film	4.38
3. Article	3.85	3. Article	3.10
4. Text	3.75	4. Poems	3.00
5. Poems	3.39	5. Text	2.92
6. Song	3.06	6. Sketch	2.87
7. Sketch	2.92	7. Song	2.55

Students' faith in the "truth" of the four photographs they examined matches Marcy Singer Gabella's findings (Gabella, 1994); they judged the photographs to be "what actually happened." Students gave these photographs of trench warfare on average the highest reliability rating of 4.6 (see Table above), and stated that the photos had a big impact on them: "the photographs were real images of the war and were powerful." Only a few students alluded to the fact that the photographs might be biased or reflected the photographer's perspective on the war. As expressed by one student, "most of these examples besides the photographs were not very reliable basically because they were not done on a first hand account and the creators could easily choose what they wanted to display." A few students did note that the photographs depicted the war in a negative light; they described the photographs as "a little one-sided" and taken "not of good things." Student recognition that the four photographs showed the negative side of war is important in light of the impact the photos made on their classmates. "The photos are hard to forget because that's what the war was like, death." If I had selected photographs showing a more positive side of the war, would that have significantly changed the students' perceptions of the war?

Unlike the students Gabella observed, who “believed without exception that the textbook tells you what actually happened,” (1994, p. 346) a majority of my students did recognize that the textbook’s author may be biased and that the “text is written by an author.” Because textbooks are “a secondary source,” they also recognized that “some things can be biased and off the truth.” One student stated, “We studied the war last year in American Studies and this book is completely different.” Many students did accept the text’s value as a source of facts or details; it received an average reliability rating of 3.75. Some students also found the textbook easier to understand than less familiar history sources like drawings and poems. “It is hard to understand sketches, poems, and songs because it is not written out for me to understand as well as the textbook,” wrote one student. The textbook’s average score of 2.92 for impact is significant. Students acknowledge that the text may contain some important facts, details, and interpretation (as one student said, “The text helps you understand the photos”), but many found it boring. “The book—to me was just facts and numbers. For instance the book said that maybe in a certain battle 300,000 were killed, but if you see that in a picture it’s much more virtual.” These findings suggest that textbooks have their place to help students locate primary sources historical context. They suggest also that teachers must provide students with guidance and practice interpreting artistic sources of historical evidence.

The drawing, “Hand to Hand Combat,” by Otto Dix, received by far the lowest average reliability rating, a score of 2.92. During the discussion of this work, students voiced their opinion that it was “more fictional” than photographs or the textbook and “just one guy’s interpretation.” Though the students negated the drawing’s value as a source of historical information, they showed insight when describing what they considered to be its message. They said it showed the fighting to be “chaotic”; “you can’t tell where one person ends and another begins—that’s what it must have been like in the trenches.” Another student’s comment alluded to a film we had watched, declaring the war to be “crazy, confusing, not simple and glorious like the professor told the students in ‘All Quiet on the

Western Front.” After listening to these remarks on the drawing I asked, “From what you’ve studied, is that an accurate description of trench warfare?” Based on the nodding and murmuring of “yes,” it may be that the students perceived some validity in the artist’s sketch after all.

The 1930’s film version of the novel, All Quiet on the Western Front was considered fairly reliable (3.92 average rating), and made a large impact on students (4.38 average rating). During the debriefing of the film, I told them the author of the novel, Eric Maria Remarque, had fought in World War I, as many of them suspected. This may have influenced students’ rating the film second in both the reliability and impact categories. They valued the film because “it was like you were seeing the war yourself,” and also because it personalized the war: “I will remember the sources that deal with real individuals. It was much sadder and more personal when Paul died than when I read about people dying in my textbook.” This personalization, as well as the visual impact of the film, may have contributed to the fact that its average rating for impact was noticeably higher than its reliability rating. A few students did comment that film can be biased, pointing out that “All Quiet on the Western Front,” “was from the perspective of a German soldier, which is an obvious bias.” Another said, “the movie seemed realistic, but it was a movie,” seeming to recognize that film does not necessarily reflect reality. The powerful visual and emotional impact of movies combined with the plethora of historical films released in recent years (e.g., “JFK” and “Braveheart”) means that it is important for history teachers to assist their students in becoming critical viewers.

The poems the students read were also written by men who had fought in the war. August Stramm fought and died for Germany, and Siegfried Sassoon was in the English army. (Cross, 1988 and Sassoon, 1920) These poems were rated fifth in terms of reliability and fourth in terms of impact; however, the poetry was specifically mentioned in several students’ comments on what sources made an impact on them: “They (photos, film, poems) were someone’s real experience. It’s easier to

relate to those and remember." "I will remember the pictures and poems and film because they affected me more. They made me understand that to the soldiers there was no glory to war. The textbook sometimes fails to express that, but by pictures and their feelings I could better understand what they went through." Poems struck a chord with some students that the textbook did not.

Discussion and Implications

Hopefully this research raises some important questions concerning the sources used in high school history courses, as well as the reliability and impact of those sources on students. Students in my study found photographs and film to be the most reliable sources, as well as the most memorable. Poetry, music, and drawings were rated as least reliable, though poetry had high impact on some students. These results underline the importance of thoughtful inclusion of sources such as photography and film in history courses. The textbook's average impact rating of 2.92 supports Gabella's suggestion that history teachers reduce their reliance on textbooks as "provider of the central narrative," and unseat themselves as "sole validator of classroom knowledge and participation" (Gabella, 1994, p. 350).

According less authority to what the teacher says and downplaying the central importance of the text are fairly revolutionary ideas to many educators, but they are supported by the National Council for the Social Studies (NCSS) curriculum standards. These standards recommend that "teachers gradually move...to a less directive role that encourages students to become independent and self-regulated learners." (p. 12) The National Standards for History echoes this, lending support to students' use of several meaningful sources when interpreting events of the past. The standard, "Historical Analysis and Interpretation," stresses the importance of "the use of more than a single source: of history books other than textbooks and of a rich variety of historical documents and artifacts" (p. 65).

The student comment, "It's rare to get video, poems, and songs in class," may reflect the reality that most history teachers

do not use a variety of sources on a regular basis. If teachers continue to rely on the text as their primary teaching resource, we fail to tap into sources that may provide greater meaning to students. When teachers use a variety of sources and help students to evaluate these sources, we are "inviting them to participate in the interpretation of significance," (Gabella, 1994, p. 357) which is certainly a worthwhile goal for history educators.

REFERENCES

- Cross, Tim. (1988) The Lost Voices of World War I. London: Bloomsbury, 1988.
- Fralin, Frances. (1985) The Indelible Image: Photographs of War, 1846 to the Present. New York: Harry N. Abrams, 1985.
- Gabella, Marcy Singer. (1994). Beyond the looking glass: Bringing students into the conversation of historical inquiry. Theory and Research in Social Education, 22(3), 340-363.
- Gabella, Marcy Singer. (1995). The art(s) of historical sense. Journal of Curriculum Studies, 27(2), 139-163.
- National Center for History in the Schools. (1996) National Standards for History. Los Angeles, CA.
- National Council for the Social Studies. (1994) Expectations of Excellence: Curriculum Standards for Social Studies. Washington, D.C.: Author.
- Sassoon, Siegfried. (1920). The War Poems of Siegfried Sassoon. London: William Heinman,. 1920.



Kerri Potter teaches History of Europe and World Religions at West High School in Iowa City, Iowa. She received her B.A. degree from the University of Northern Iowa. Presently, she is a student in the M.A. program in social studies education at the University of Iowa.

*Special thanks to Benjamin Lustig for his assistance
in gathering sources and interpreting data.*

IOWA COUNCILOR

Official Publication
of the
Iowa Council for the Social Studies

Vol. IV, No. 2

April, 1953

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PRESIDENT'S LETTER.....	30
CRITICISMS ASK FOR ANSWERS.....	33
WORKSHOP FOR STATE OFFICERS AND COMMITTEE MEMBERS.....	37
A STUDENT REPORTS.....	40
MUSIC IN THE AMERICAN HISTORY COURSE.....	44
A FIFTH GRADE "FAIR".....	46
PUPILS GATHER IOWA MADE PRODUCTS.....	48
HOW WE DID IT.....	49
ANNOUNCING THE ECONOMIC EDUCATION WORKSHOP.....	51
AUDIO-VISUAL MATERIALS.....	52
BOOK REVIEW.....	55
EDITOR'S NOTE.....	58
OUR CONTRIBUTORS.....	60

OFFICERS

President

G. Arthur Luther
Charles City H. S.
Charles City

Vice-President

Berniece Helff
Campus School
Cedar Falls

Secretary-Treasurer

Arthur E. Soderlind
University High School
Iowa City

Editor

Marguerite Skilling
Boone H. S.
Boone

Business Manager

Martha Wangberg
Thos. Jefferson H. S.
Council Bluffs

MUSIC IN THE AMERICAN HISTORY COURSE
By Richard Palmer

Nearly every American History text book contains units on cultural history. I think we miss a good opportunity if we do not use music to furnish further stimulation. In this respect, we are ably assisted by the motion picture which, with varying degrees of accuracy, has enabled us to relive the eras of Caruso, Jolson, Lillian Russel, Eva Tanguay, and a host of others.

We are well acquainted with fine documentary records, many of which utilize music and original voices to present the spirit of their time. I have also found it advantageous to use music alone, some recreated and some original as taken from the old Edison records.

One could start very early in the year with excerpts from Sumac's Capital recordings of songs based on the themes and chants of the Incas. New Records Inc. has a very fine album of six ballads sung in colonial America. None would make today's hit parade, but who can deny the fascination of such former hits as the "Song of Six Queens Married to Henry VIII King of England" or "The Lamentable Complaint of Queen Mary"---it's very lamentable and very long. Coral Records gives us an album of American Folklore sung by Tom Scott. Do you recall "Soldier, Soldier will you Marry me"? It's one of the twelve old American ballads on the record. The Ford Museum has made available several of the early American dances such as the Lady Walpole Reel. It would take good feet and lots of endurance to keep pace with some of these.

Moving through the pages of history, there is a fine R.C.A. album of Stephen Fos-

ter in song and story. Do you like the color and the spirit of the gay nineties? Then let Beatrice Kay carry you and your students on the wave of song from 1890 to World War I. R. C.A. again brings us the America of yesterday with "Heaven will Protect the Working Girl", "She is more to be Pitied than Censored", "She's only a Bird in a Gilded Cage" - and a host of others. Decca gives us a splendid collection of 37 Gay Nineties songs as sung by Frank Luther.

Perhaps you'd prefer actual voices from the past. Then let the Wagner Research Corporation of New York City help you with their inexpensive microdisc recordings, about three minutes of Americana per disc. Here we have the voices of Lucretia Bori, Eva Tanguay, Nora Bayes, Lillian Russel, Rudolph Valentino, Dame Nellie Melba, Lew Dockstadter, John McCormick, Enrico Caruso, Chauncey Olcott, and many others. Some of these take us into the twenties. R. C. A. has again made available full albums of Caruso, McCormick, and Sir Harry Lauder. Perfect recordings? No. Immortal treasures of a bygone age? Yes.

From 1920 to recent years, Decca has albums devoted to the song hits of each year. What did you sing and dance when you were in high school? In 1923, it was "Yes, we have No Bananas". My graduation year was 1942 with, "The White Cliffs of Dover" and "Deep in the Heart of Texas".

Is all this trivial? I think not. We try to portray the American story. And music is as important as locations, dates, men, and causes. Without it, our story would be as incomplete as a man without a soul.

OUR CONTRIBUTORS

WALDEMAN GJERDE, Audio-Visual Specialist - a member of the Curriculum Laboratory staff at Iowa State Teachers College, is a favorite and regular contributor to the Councilor.

KAY KRIGSTEN, a student in Central High School, Sioux City, Iowa, is the first student to appear in the Councilor. Her teacher is Mayme Yahr, American History instructor in Central High. The Councilor welcomes Kay and hopes to find more students among its contributors.

G. ARTHUR LUTHER, ICSS president, reports the story of the Council's first workshop for state officers and committeemen. Those in attendance felt the workshop very helpful in coordinating the work of the various departments of the Council.

The review of the month came from C. J. MARTINDALE. Mr. Martindale is Boys' Advisor and Psychology instructor in the Senior High School and Junior College at Boone, Iowa.

MRS. MARJORIE NUTTING, fifth and sixth grade teacher in the Milor, Iowa, schools, contributes the interesting device for teaching appreciation of peoples in faraway lands.

RICHARD PALMER teaches American History and Speech in the Algona, Iowa, high school.

HARLAND REED is the director of Elementary Education in Boone, Iowa. The project-reported was carried on in one of the elementary schools under his supervision.

MARTIN SCHMIDT is the fourth grade teacher at the Washington School, Charles City, Iowa.

MRS. MARGARET J. WILLIAMS is a member of the Department of Education, Cornell College, Mt. Vernon, Iowa.

The Iowa Journal for the Social Studies (2018)
Special Issue: *Past, Present, and Future: The State of Social Studies in Iowa*

About the Journal

The *Iowa Journal for the Social Studies* is a peer-reviewed, electronic journal that provides an outlet for research, best practices, curriculum work, and media reviews in social studies education.

Audience

Each issue of *IJSS* will include work relevant to social studies researchers and educators in K-12 and higher education.

Proposed Call for Manuscripts—Volume 28, Issue 1 (Special Issue: *Past, Present, and Future: The State of Social Studies in Iowa*)

The editors of the *Iowa Journal for the Social Studies*, a peer-reviewed electronic journal, issue a call to submit manuscripts for a special issue that looks at past volumes of the *Iowa Council for the Social Studies* publications through the lens of social studies today. Authors are encouraged to select a topic, a strategy, or other aspect of social studies instruction from a previous issue (available at: <https://iowajournalforthesocialstudies.weebly.com/>) and discuss the extent to which the focus of a previously published article influences, no longer influences, and/or should be revisited by social studies educators today. For example, are ideas published in a 1957 article economics education or a 1993 article on the influence of the national history standards on social studies instruction in Iowa still relevant? What has changed? What remains the same? In either case, is the answer good for social studies instruction in Iowa today?

Authors are encouraged to draw upon current literature in the field and/or propose lesson plans that reflect current and effective practices in the social studies.

CFP posted: January, 2018

Submissions due by: July 1, 2018

Submissions sent out for review: Upon receipt-July 8, 2018

Reviews returned: August 14, 2018

Author revisions submitted: September 24, 2017

Publication: Fall 2018

Author Guidelines

Submissions from all social studies disciplines as well as from interdisciplinary perspectives are eligible for publication. Each submission will be refereed using a double-blind peer review process. All submissions should be formatted in Microsoft Word and submitted via email to the editor (jason-harshman@uiowa.edu).

Manuscripts must meet the following requirements to be sent for review:

- The manuscript must be void of author(s) name and institution(s).

- Submitted in Microsoft .doc or .docx format, using *Times New Roman*, size 12 font, double spaced with graphics placed within the submission. **Please do not use Google docs.**
- All graphics, tables, charts, and other images must be placed within the submission, **not** at the end or in a separate document.
- Formatted according to the most recent edition of the *Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (APA)*.
- Manuscripts that do not comply with APA format will be returned without review.
- An abstract of 150 words or less and a maximum of five keywords should precede the manuscript and be included in the same file.
- Manuscripts should be 2,000 to 5,000 words in length, *excluding the abstract, references, and endnotes*. Articles submitted for the “Teacher Feature” and “Resource Review” sections may be 1,000 to 3,000 words.
- If necessary, please use endnotes instead of footnotes.
- All manuscripts must be written in English.

The email submission must include:

- A biography for each author of 50 words or less (this can be included with the separate title page).
- Provide the title page, abstract, complete manuscript, and references, in Microsoft Word format, all in one file.
- A statement in the body of the email that confirms that the manuscript includes original work, meets submission guidelines, has not been published elsewhere, and is not under consideration by another publication.
- Indication in the email message of the section the manuscript is being submitted for: Theory and Research, Conceptual and Curriculum work, Classroom Practice, Teacher Feature, Resource Review. *Descriptions for each section are available at the IJSS website.*